swept? Is there a system of rotation of districts or is work done every day in parts of each district?

A. There is no system of rotation of work in districts. Work is done each day in parts of districts. Many streets need cleaning oftener than others; some are cleaned every day, some two or three times a week. The work is applied where it will do the most good and is the most needed.

In other words, there is no regular system upon which each street receives a certain amount of labor within a certain specified time. Work is spasmodic, and applied accertaing to fanced need in the most of the needed of the system is patiently insufficient for the neede of a great city. The principal streets (and in this we though not only Broadway and the lateral avonues, but the principal cross thoroughtares) should be swept once in every twenty-tour hours, and this always at night. Ashes should be removed regularly before eight A. M. in winter and seven A. M. in summer. The whole city should be thoroughly cleaned and purified at least once in each week.

Is such a cemand unreasonable?

Is originally inless of payement, every

pet, after deducting \$00,000 foscioled from sales of garbage.

Philadelphia, with 600 miles of streets, spent in the first ten months of 1877 for street cleaning, in-including removal of ashes and garbage, \$275,000, a total for the year, at the same ratio, of \$330,000, or \$550 per mile.

New York, with 250 miles of pavement, spent in 1877 for street cleaning, exclusive of removing dead animals or cleansing privios, \$725,000, or \$2,900 per mile, and asks for the year 1878 for \$1,077,640, or \$4,310 per mile.

These figures need no commentary.

PHIVATE EXPERIMINE.

reisons in their employ? Give full list on this point? The Commissioners reply:—
A. This department has no knowledge of any streets wept by private citizens or persons in their employ, and captain Gunner, the Superintendent of the deartment, informed your committee that the streets is the above-mentioned area are all refurned by his spectors as regularly swept by his department and not all pay is drawn for such service.

Out of this work.

What shall be and of a system which thus ignores fact so unversally recognized, which is so administred as to necessitate the interference of citizens to rotect themselves, at additional expense, from the iscoming and which has the hardshood to claim payment or services which the mere lact of this private inter-

the principal avenues once in twenty-tour hours. The price to be paid was \$490,000. The amount was satisfactory to the contractors. They never asked an increase, and both Mr. Brown and his assignee, Mr Whiting, testified at different times under oath that their profits averaged \$100,000 per year, and that could they shake themselves absolutely clear from all political influence those profits would be largely increased. The Hoard of Folice claim to do no more work than was contemplated by the specifications of the Brown contract, nor, in the judgment of your committee, do they do the teter.

But, say people uninformed as to details of this work, extensive and coally apparatus is necessary in Ideaning a large city. Have not the Police Board expensed, necessarily, much of their large appropriation in the purchase of such apparatus? Lot us see:—

PURCHASE OF APPARATUS.

In May, 1876, three years after the Board assumed control of street cleaning, they owned, as working material, live small sweeping machines in good order and six until for use, but in process of repair; four water carts in good order, forty department carts in working order and flip broken and stored away as useless.

These articles were not acquired by purchase, but were inherited from Mesers Brown, Devoe & Knapp, the former contractors. In like manner a number of horses came into the possession of the Board, with their harness, both horses and harness being of poor quality.

Between May, 1876, and May, 1877, the depart-

were inherited from Messrs. Brown, hevoe & Knapp, the former contractors. In like manner a number of horses came into the possession of the Board, with their harbess, both horses and harness being of poor quality.

Between May, 1876, and May, 1877, the department having hired from the city at nominal ront the market buildings and wharf at the foot of East Seventeenth street, proceeded there to establish shops, utilize and repair the material upon their hands and to get their tools into some order. Your committee have inspected this establishment, and can commend the order and system which there provail. In May, 1877, the department had cleven small machines in good order, jour large machines in good order, sixteen water carts and eighty-two department carts, all in good condition. But it will be solicen that the number of machines has not been increased into 1876; they have simply been repaired, and the increase in the number of carts is due not to purchase but to repairing and putting together old material.

In June, 1877, the department owned eighty-two borses, with proper harness for all the street sweeping machines and water carts and for fity-seven department carts. Of these horses the great majority had come cown from the old contractors, and were generally discussed and lame. They have good care and treatment, but hardly one of them can to a full day's work. Forey-two carts remained idle for want of horses, and the Commissioners strendously issue that the existing appropriation is insuffluent to emable them to porchase them. Of the vessels used in carrying away increbises. The same scows. Nose of these represent new purchases. These and scows are part of the heritage from Brown, Devoe & Kanpp.

To eke out their apparatus the department is forced to hire 225 carts, with a corresponding number of horses and harness and from thirty to thruy-flee scows, in addition to those above enumerated.

It will be seen at once that the apparatus owned by the city is outerly madequate to the work and the fitter of the d

Shrourng's hope for the lature.

2. Bucange the demant he \$1.977.549 made by them for
the year 1875 upon the heard of Appendiment is, upon its
lare, an entrage amon in public, and
Lysty, for reasons which, will talky appear in our discus-

ceive their money's worth in clean streets? you committee propose to treat:—

First—By setting forth at length the obstacles which the Police Commessioners insist obstruct them in the propositionarce of their duty, and which, they claim, should excuse the imperfect performance of these duties, together with the plinion of your committee on such claims, and Scond—The facts which is the judgment of your committee, are the real causes of the failure of the Police Departs the act of the real causes of the failure of the Police Departs. ted, are the real causes of the failure of the iment to cleanse this city.

The department claims:—

the transmission proposition of these two articles account. That the communicating of these two articles account the whole mass affensive, and brings it within the provisions of chapter 60-4, have of 1875, and provisions of chapter 60-4, have of 1875.

be seep closes in clearly twenty-our hours, and this stars at high, while a first or transcent from the stars at high, while the thoroughly cleaned and unrised in self codes of the stars, and the stars and the st

foregoing statements of one of the Police Commissioners. Those statements establish the fact that absolutely no effort is made by the department to separate the garbage from the ashes an arrest duriot this city. But time very admixture of garbage is the cause why no place can be secured for the disposal of the retuse with which it is mixed. The legislation of which the Police Board compliants is eminently proper and just. We do not propose to permit our rivers and bays to become a mass of corrupting matter, nor do we blame adjacent communities for protecting their shores from this disgusting and pessionital visitation.

VALUE OF STREET SWEEPINGS.

More claim to on the more were than war content, place by the specifications of the Brown contract, and predictions of the Brown contract of the product of the Brown contract of the product of the Brown contract of the product of t

hot season, and it is seen weary during the winter, an per printed papers on that subject herewith
nost you—there will be no occasion for mixing, for
there will be nothing to mix. But if its left uncollected for days these poor people must get rid
of it, and putting it in with ashes is the least
oftensive to them and the most natural
and least expensive way to get rid if
the nusance. Systematic removal of garbage daily, tri and sent weekly will care
mixing. The proper tureau should keep a book ofcomplaints, where all citizens can register their compishits and the contractors be immediately notified
of them and to remove the garbage. If not promptly
come do it at his expanse, no matter what it costs.
The garbage contractors utilize most of the garbage
in feeding hops out of the city on its outskirts, where
it will give but little offence. Eteraal vigilance on
these contractors is, we find, the only remedy."
Your committee do not doubt that at first there
would be difficulties in the enforcement of this separation; but that these difficulties would be imagerable, as declared by the Police Commissioners, in
simple nonzense. Let it be thoroughly known that
at certain hours in the morning or evening garbage
would be called for and collected; let the habit once
be established of meeting the garbage cart without
disappointment or delay, and the collection would
seen be made as expeditiously and requiarly as the

DEAR SIR-Your favor of yesterday is received, and I hasten to answer your inquiry. The Bureau of Street Wesnitzh has intely, for want of here. DEAR SIM-Your layor in quiry. The Bureau of Street cleaning has lately, for want of better opportunity, been compelled to dispose of the street cleaning material in New Jersey, paying the parties who receive and unique it at their own cost £50 per scow load.

This is the cleanest opportunity now offered for wasting street cleaning material. The towage is short, in smooth water, and our tugs with trains of scows can go with the tide both ways. At this scasson of the year the open sea cannot be encountered with the insufficient tugs and water

water, and our tugs with trains of acows can go wish she tide both ways. At this season of the year the open season to the both ways. At this season of the year the open season to the burstletent tugs and water craft of the Bureau.

Mr. Switt, in Juliant, proposed to receive on board of his wasel are a term of five or ten years.

You will notice, first, that Mr. Swift wants garbage only, and he wants all the garbage from the city. The Bureau of Street Cleaning cannot give him garbage only, nor can they give him sell (nor half) of the garbage of the city of New York; second, he wants a contract for five or ten years, which the Board of Police cannot make.

You wilch the Board of Police cannot make.

Yory respectfully, SIDSEY P. NIOHOLS.

Well and appropriately is the word "wasted" used hore. A material, which if handled with judgment and ordinary care should return at least thirty per cent on the cost of its collection, is not only given away, but large sums of monoy are heedlessly squan-

and ordinary care should return at least thirty per cent on the cost of its collection, is not only given away, but large sums of money are beedlessly squandered in inducing site recipients to accept the gift. A more grievous case of miamanagement in office is rarely exhibited, and when, in addition to this, we see that the Police Department not only makes no effort to separate garbage from other refuse, but actually encourages and incites its admixture, we cannot listen with much patience to its reiterated clamor for more legislation and a longer purso as a remedy for the cvils of which they are practically the authors. Nor do we consider that the want of dumping places is a valid excuse for their shortcomings; but, remembering that the great bulk of the refuse of the city if properly cleared of garbage is both inoffensive and useful, and that no effort whatever is made to render it thus inoffensive and useful, we are rather forced to the conclusion that intelligent and capable men in thus putting forward such excuses are simply availing themselves of the popular ignorance of the should be most active. Similar excuses if avanced in the conduct of private business would be held to stuffly their authors, and the public cannot consent to accept them as valid until the Police Commissioners have shown long con-

if advanced in the conduct of private business would be held to stuffity their authors, and the public cannot consent to accept them as valid until the Police Commissioners have shown long continued, persistent and systematic efforts to carry out their duties in separating garoage, and in disposing of it and of the remaining refuse in a proper and business-like method.

Pointe Board claims, secondly, that they had not the proper apparatus for the conduct of their work; that they need horses, carls, sweeping machines, water carls, scows and steam tight, and that they have no means wherewith to buy them. Your committee admits the first clause of their claim as true. They do need all these things, and need them sorely. The horses and carls other than those owned by the department are hired by the day', they are wrighted beyond description, the carts holding but theirly cubic feet to the forty-one cubic feet of the department carls; the horses are the most feeble and decrept to their kind, unable in most instances to drag anything like a full load, and only then to other through the streets, consuming double the time re-

inity and judiciously managed, be saved from the appropriation of \$725,000 made them this year, and the streets, in addition, be cleaned as they never have been creaned bolore. One reason for this belief will be given later on.

WINT THE BOARD FAILS.

Having stated as fairly and honestly as possible the claims of the Police Board to spublic indulgence your committee now propose to set forth their own judgment as to the real cause of the failure of that Board to properly cleanes the city. It is not far to seek. The words "political influence" and the invariable attendant "patronage" supply the key. Your committee charge that the Street Cleaning Bureau of this city is managed rather in the interest of party than of clean sirects; that its chief office is to provide sine-cares for ward politicians and employment for those whose votes keep ward politicians and those of higher grade bonian them in power; that much of the public moneys distoursed by its managers goes to men who yield little if any value in return, and that the money so diverted from its legitimate object should, if rightly and properly expended, suffice not only to keep this city abundantly clean and purchase all necessary material for so doing but yield a surplus for return to the city treasury at the end of the year. We further charge that the wages paid laborers are excessive, much above the merit of comployed and greater than those laborers could command from any private employer; that such wages are paid knowningly by the Police foord with full cognizance of such facing and are so paid tor political purposes; that the appointments to office and employment in labor in no degree depend upon the merits of the candidate or his ability to bil the vecans place; that such appointments and employment are awarded as matters of pairounge, chiefly by men night in power in municipal politics, to whose commands the Police Commissioners are forced to lend as obecated ear a perit of their own peace, if not of their places, in case of non-compliance. We charges

There are five superintendents of the bureau squalled, whereat there are poince captains at \$2,000 a year each, one roundsman at \$1,200 and one officer at \$1,200. The maintenance of these officers are charged on both

the salaries of these officers are charged on both police and street cleaning appropriations, being paid from one and repaid into the Comptroller's office at the end of the year from the other, an unnecessary and vicious practice, involving a medesa increase of the street eleganing appropriation and a possible leps of interest to the city.

There is a deputy inspector at \$2,500 a year, a superintendent of shades at \$1,500, a chief clerk at \$5,600, a pay roll clerk at \$2,500, a time clerk at \$5,600, a pay roll clerk at \$2,000, a time clerk at \$5,600, a chief clerk at \$1,200 each, to create at \$1,600 and three minor clerks at \$1,200 each.

There are themp-one foremen at \$1,000 each, forty-six gangmen at \$2 a day each, tourteen dump inspectors at \$500 per annum each, two ledgraph operators at \$900 each (carriery distinct, as we understand, from the regular police operatives), sixteen watchmen at dumps at \$2 a day each, two tag appraiss at \$1,400 each; two engineers at \$1,140 each and six other employes on tagsat \$720 each, then there are cetailed to Captain Gunter, Superintendent, an additional forehalf and gangmen, and two adaptional gangmen are detailed as clerks in the office. The salaries of these

men, toots up, in the estimates of the department 1878, \$63,890, and this is payable in good had weather alike, whether work be done no. Your committee has obtained and assecte be a list of the patriots who kindly serve as foremen gangmen, together with the occupations with withey amuse their leisure hours. Time would fail describe them alk a few instances must suffice, is a merchant, a member of a doubtown firm, if are injuncy dealers, we are clerks, one keeps a!!

qualified to render honest work.

The wages paid the sweepers are grossly in excess of what they could command elsewhere. The Commissioners, in course of conversation on the Brown contract, saie to your committee that the reason Brown made so much out of his contract was that he only paid his men it each per day. "Why don't you pay the same wages?" we asked. "Just come in here," was the reply, "and attempt to lower the wages of these men or to lengthen the number of lours in their day and see how long you would remain, and how pleasant it would be made for you while you stayed." And this admission was coupled with the acknowledgment that the laborers in question were, as alleged by your committee, poor miscrable objects, hardly able, in many instances, to stand without the support of their brooms and hoes.

Your committee submits that no further proof is needed as to its charge on the question of the capacity of the labor employed and of the undue amount of wages plud therefor. It would simply call attention to the fact that if proper wages were paid, and by proper wages we mean not to exceed \$2,000 per month, a saving of theirty-seven per cent would be at once effected in this item of the estimates alone.

Appointment was this—

Q. State on whose recommendation these men (the formen and gangmen) were appointed, giving names? A. The records of this department do not show on whose recommendation clerks were employed; many of them have been in the service many years; as to foremen and damp inspectors, they have been generally employed on the recommendation of reputable cliticans, who have vouched for their identity and efficiency.

records of this department do not show on whose recommendation cierks were employed; many of them have been in the service maily years; as to foremen and damp inspectors, they have been generally employed on the recommendation of reputable citizens, who have vouched for their idedity and efficiency.

The archives of the department do not enable us to give the names of the gentiemen recommending the several such employés, and if they did we should be unwilling to furnish their names to the public without the assent of those gentiemen.

Should your committee permit itself to induige in conjecture rather than exact facts, the names of the reputable gentiemen aforesaid would present thomseives with but little research.

The department is equally non-committal as to the calling and eccupation of these officiers. They say, "So far as this department has any knowledge they (the foremen and gangmen) did not exercise any estensible calling other than that called for by their duties in the Street Cleaning Department."

The fact is—and it is as well recognized as the daily rising of the sun—that these appointments are in the hands of those who rule the so-called politics of this mingoverned city, are looked upon as properly belonging to them and are made at their beheat, with no demur at the character and fitness or the nominee, no matter what that character and fitness may be. This

again, still modestly veiling his face. But it may be news to him, as it certainly was to your committee, that his praiseworthy humanity has been able to transform ab organization intended to clean streets into a charitable oureau for employment of paupers. The fact is that the Superintendent of Street Cleaning has absolutely no choice whatever in the selection of his men. They come to him with tokets from citizons so reputable and of such influence that he is forced, whatever his opinion of the candidate, to enroit him forthwith. Here is the plague spot of our municipal administration, the root of the disease that is sapping our very life as a city.

Benind these gentlamen in the Police Board stands a power which forces them to employ men whom they know and acknowledge to be unfit for their places; to make places for others who render no work in return for the money which they draw; to hire and discharge with no reserence to capability or the quality of quantity of the work done or to be done.

Is it right, is it housest for them to submit? Have they no duties to those who provide the means, as well as to those whose influence gives them the positions they hold? Are they not, in acquiescing silently in a system which they of all men know to be corrupt and debasing, consulting their own case and emotument to the detriment of the public good? In the judgment of your committee there can be but one answer to this question.

inous they hold? Are they not, in acquiescing sidenty and debasing, consulting their own ease and emotument to the determent of the public good? In the judgment of your committee there can be but one answer to this question.

From this wicked system of political patronage, this barter of office and employment for corrupt ends, grow all the ordis of which we as laxpayers have to complain. Why go further into details and recount afresh the system or want of system which sweeps a street and piles up the dirt days before the carts are ready to remove it; which makes no regular provision of vessols to carry away reiuse and gives this as an excess of the accumulation of festering garbage in the open atreet; which carries out to see at large expense and casts away material which, if properly utilized, would yield large revenues to the city coffers; which, not content with this waste, casts after it handfuls of money in payment for the privilege of giving what should rather be eagerly sought at remunerative prices; which makes no effort to separate garbage from ashes, and cries out that each separation is an impossibility; which, in one word, is lavish in demand, rien in excuse, utterly wanting in performance. So long as the present appointing and employment system continues so long will our streets remain fifty and our money be wasted. Money without end may be appropriated, the Legislature may pass countless laws to meet every possible contingency. All will be of no avail till public officians are rought to recognize the fact that in dealing with public funds it is their duty to get full value for every cent expended as though that money were their own; that in appointing their subordinates fitness and capacity are alone to be considered; that the largest amount of work is to be secured for the smallest amount of pay, and that in place of crying out at every obstacle which freachts itself it is better to set about discovering the way to surmount.

One word more under this head. It will have been noticed that the city

pended in other cities and of the comparative number of men employed.

New York employs, exclusive of the Commissioners at the head of the bureaut but counting the gaugmen and dump inspectors, given above, 109 related officials at stipenes ranging from \$3,000 to \$720 each and about 1,200 laborers of different classes—in round num-

In histories is payed streets in the payed streets in the payed ont, I checker, 5 cm and the payed on a payed

Signt soil frame part, to a complete a tring the mean a real formal fine part of the part

singers, mostly upon the recommendation of reputable citizens desiring to do an act of charity to worthy men in finding them the means for the support of their families.

Here the reputable citizen makes his appearance again, still motestly veiling his face. But it may be again, still motestly upon the again again.

But the most interesting matter in connection with Manchester is the disposition of their reluse. Situated is unland, its only water communication to River Irwell, against the contamination of which the Rivers' Pollution Commissioners have set their faces as a flint, the cutre elder portion of the town dependent upon the old-fashioned privy as the receptacle for excrement, here, indeed, was a community that might well cry out, "What shall we do with our refuse?"

pendent upon the oid-fashioned privy as the receptuals for excrement, here, indeed, was a community that might well cry out, "What shall we do with our rejuse?"

WHAT GARNAGE IS WORTH.

But the cry was brief, and in response to well directed effort the answer came. Under the direction of the health Board yards were selected and purchased by the corporation where the rejuse is sorted, that which is salable sold, that which is useless burned, and the remainder converted into manure and sold. Even the very urine of the city is utilized. We quote here a faw words from the report of the Health Officer for 1876. In 1876 the rejuse collected by the Health Committee weighed 147,697 tons. The composition of the material may be judged from the following analysis of a single week's collection:—

Paper, I ton.

Dead animasis, 2 tons.

Healt this and oill cans and iron, 33 tons.

Slaughterhouse refuse, 60 tons.

Slaughterhouse refuse, 60 tons.

Broken pots, glasses, &c., 30 tons.

Vegetable refuse, 90 tons.

Ginders, 1,344 tons.

Of these materials the dead animals, slaughter bonse refuse and a portion of the focal matter and fine ashes are incorporated by grinding, logeliber with quantity of putrid lish, and formed into manure, the ammonia being converted into sulphate and is evolved. The mixture is saturated with urine, a portion of which has undergone concentration. Of this manure 1,500 tons were manufactured and sold. The broken pois, bottles and glass, burreand sing, fine coal and a portion of the cinders, with similar matter, are ground up with sand and lime into mortar of excellent quantry, and of this 3,500 tons were sold. The oil from and times are readily disposed of, as the demand is considerable, probably for the manufacture of copperas. The regs and paper are scarcely in sufficient quantry at present for full utilization, but as the new system is developed they will be better worth the trouble of separation. The vegetable refuse we have at present no use for, and we believe it best to reduce their volume by bur

selves."

It, without giving further details in possession of your committee as to other cities, we compare the figures and results above given with the estimates presented by our Board of Folice for 1878, they give warrant enough for our assertion, that this department is wasting the money of the taxpayers is unnecessary and exerbitant salaries and wages, that even if the city were well cleaned the amount expended therefor would be altogether too high, but that in view of the condition of the streets for the last year the expenditure of \$725,000 or any like sum, no purchase of new material forming part thereof, is simply aboard, and calls for the expressive on those charged with its administration.

If any could still exists on this point your committee desire to simply cite a remark made by a gentleman high in office in the department to this effect:—"Gentlemen," said he, will had the cleaning of the city, untrammelled by pointed influence of deciation, I could keep it as clean as a partor floor for \$400,000 a year and retire in two years rich enough for all my wants." With this remark we close the third branch of our inquiry.

The rexempy.

We now take up the last and most important question ment is wasting the money of the taxpayers in unnecessary and exercitant chairs and wages, that even if the only were well cleaned the amount expended therefor would be altogether too high, but that in view of the condition of the streets for the last year the expenditure of \$725,000 or any like sum, no purchase of new material forming part thereof, is simply abourd, and calls for the severest consure on those charged with its administration.

If any doubt still exists on this point your committee desire to simply dite a remark made by a gentleman high in office in the department to this effect—Gentlemen, which is experiently untrammelled by political influence of detailou, I could keep it as clean as a parior floor for \$400,000 a year and retire in two years rich chough for all my wants. With this remark we close the third branch of our inquiry.

We now take up the last she most important question of all. What remeny can be found for these abuses? The first step lies with all good citizens, and consists in the formation of a liesitup public officials. Men with question of the duties of public officials. Men with

too great temptations to paironage a dictation, which of all things carefully avoided. We have therefore One word before we close. Whilewe have

One word before we close. While we have not extenuated, we have set down naught is maire we shall be constacted harsh in Calling abuses by right names we answer that the time for dainty whas passed. When men who have placed the save of a literime into real estate in this city, thinkin the safest investment for their children, and it selves forced to abandon their property from mail to meet the enormous taxes levied upon it at vitions far above its situale price; when the near our den which this sorely burdened people have bear is the angular impost laid upon them to progod government and all that a good governs should offer its citizens; when, after pisching saving to meet that impost, and providing it in a sufficient to supply the best and fittest of everythizees a large portion of those revenues turned at the body pointer a horder of diers, whose only best and office it is to perpetuate the rotten system whas brought them into being, realizing the old (liable in the spectacle of this mighty city bound is and ofto to be delivered over to a flock of loating creatures, drawing from her very vitals the a ment which sives them strangth to four and and foot to be delivered over to a flock of loathsome creatures, drawing from her very vitals the maviment which gives them strength to flout and dishonor her, shall we sit idly by and make no sign? It ever there was a time when it was expedient as well as right to speak plainly now is the time; and your committee, feeling that, has not attempted to shirk its duty. Personally they have none but the kindest feeling to the felice Commissioners, who have afforted them every facility in the prosecution of their inquiries; but as exponents of the system of paying high wages for worthers labor and of appointments to place under dictation they, in the judgment of your commistee, are facility in duty to the public, whose servants they are, and as such subject to reduke.

THATCHWELL ADAMS. 3 Commistee.

NEW YORK, Jan. 3, 1878.

COMMISSIONER EMBARDT'S REQUEST.

COMMISSIONER SEMBRIDT'S REQUEST.

The committee were then discharged, the report was ordered to be printed and a vote of thanks was tendered the members of the committee for the able manner in which they had performed their work.

Police Commissioner Erhardt arose and said soat, although he was not a member, he believed the society permitted the free expression of views from outsiders as well as from its own members, and, therefore, he would like to suggest the justice of allowing the Police Commissioners to prepare a statement of their side of the question to fellow the report arready read, He had listened to the exhaustive and able paper submitted; and, although agreeing with it in many particulars, the committee had, in his opinion, drawn incorrect conclusions, which the Commissioners could refute if permitted to hand in a counter statement. The society evidently wished not to publish a one sided story, but to give tuil privilege to those accused to answer in their own behalf.

A motion was then passed that the Police Commis stopers, through Commissioner Erhardt, be asked to write a counter statement, to be given to the Execu-